



SCOUTS[®]
Creating a Better World

World Organization of the Scout Movement
Organisation Mondiale du Mouvement Scout
Всемирная Организация Скаутского Движения
Organización Mundial del Movimiento Scout
المنظمة العالمية للحركة الكشفية

**World Scout Bureau, Central Office
Bureau Mondial du Scoutisme, Siège**

Rue du Pré-Jérôme 5
P.O. Box 91
1211 Geneva 4 Plainpalais
SWITZERLAND

Phone (+41 22) 705 10 10
Fax (+41 22) 705 10 20
Email worldbureau@scout.org
Web scout.org

Circular N° 15/2010

To: International Commissioners

May 2010

World Scout Committee consideration of Governance Review Task Force report

Dear Colleagues,

Introduction

As you are aware, a major review of the governance of the World Organization of the Scout Movement (WOSM) has been underway since the World Scout Conference in Tunisia in 2005. This has been led by a Governance Review Task Force (GRTF) which was set up by the World Scout Committee (WSC) specially to conduct that review.

At the last World Scout Conference held in Korea in July 2008 a number of decisions were made, including amendments to the WOSM Constitution, based on recommendations made by the GRTF and accepted by the WSC. Following that Conference, the WSC established a new GRTF to bring the governance review to a conclusion. The task force was charged with the responsibility to report regularly to the WSC and to deliver a final report and recommendations to the WSC in time for the next World Scout Conference to be held in Brazil in January 2011.

At its meeting in September 2009, the WSC considered an interim report from the GRTF, which focussed on requirements for *WOSM Membership*. At its latest meeting in March 2010, the WSC received the final GRTF report, which had been prepared following a series of consultations with National Scout Organizations (NSOs) on the following subjects:

- *Representation and Communications*
- *Operations*
- *World and Regional Committees.*

The WSC decided at that latest meeting that the GRTF report should be circulated to all NSOs with the WSC's decisions on the recommendations contained therein, with appropriate explanation of the reasons for the WSC's decisions, especially on Recommendation 2.1.1 on youth involvement in governance.

This circular, therefore, summarises for the information of all NSOs the decisions that the WSC has taken on the various recommendations of the GRTF contained in both its reports. Many of these recommendations will, if they are to be implemented, require endorsement by the World Scout Conference and, in some cases, further amendments to the WOSM Constitution. Work is now proceeding to prepare these proposals for the World Scout Conference in Brazil in 2011.

Discussion papers and reports from the Governance Review Task Force

The following documents can be downloaded from the scout.org website:

- *Discussion Paper 1 - WOSM Membership*
- This became the GRTF's Interim Report submitted to the WSC in September 2009
- *Discussion Paper 2 - Representation and Communications*
- *Discussion Paper 3 - Operations*
- *Discussion Paper 4 - World and Regional Committees*
- *Final Report to the World Scout Committee*

1. WSC decisions on GRTF recommendations included in the Interim Report on WOSM Membership

The WSC, at its meeting in September 2009, considered the GRTF's recommendations on WOSM Membership. The text of the recommendations is shown in italics below, followed by the WSC's decision on each one:

Federations

1. *The WSC consider putting a resolution to the World Scout Conference asking the Conference to agree with the WSC's current position on federations.*
2. *The current requirements of WOSM as to constitutions be clarified to allow for appropriate and necessary sanctions to be applied to constituent associations in federations rather than only to the federation as a whole.*
3. *It be a requirement that federation constitutions make appropriate provisions to deal with the situation where the work of a federation can be frozen if just one constituent association declines to work with the others.*
 - A roundtable meeting will be organised, in collaboration with the GRTF and the Constitutions Committee, to be attended by some WSC members, at which NSOs (Federations and single Organizations) may express their views on the recommendations concerning future policy on Federations. A report on the outcomes of these discussions will be made to the next World Scout Committee meeting to inform the Committee's consideration of the Task Force's recommendations on this issue, with a view to putting a clear proposal to the next World Scout Conference.
(Note: This roundtable took place in Budapest, Hungary, in March 2010.)

National Scout Organizations

4. *The existing category of Accredited National Scout Organization be expanded and re-named Accredited Scout Organization.*
5. *Accredited Scout Organization status be available to a Scout organization which is in:*
 - *an overseas territory/department of a politically independent country (that is, a sovereign state)*
 - *an autonomous region of a sovereign state*
6. *If potential Accredited Scout Organizations are in countries with an NSO already, the conditions for recognition as an Accredited Scout Organisation should include the agreement of that NSO.*
7. *The 1,000 member membership requirement for recognition as an NSO be removed.*
(Note 1: *The issue of WOSM membership has implications for the voting system at World Scout Conferences. This will be addressed in future proposals but the decisions of the World Scout Committee are requested on the principles set out here, without prejudice to future decisions on voting rights.*)
(Note 2: *The respective requirements for recognition as an NSO or an ASO will need to be distinctly stated, with appropriate references in the Constitution.*)
 - These recommendations were accepted (Recommendation 5 on Accredited Scout Organizations being accepted in principle). Proposed amendments to the Appendix to the WOSM Constitution on Accredited (National) Scout Organizations – and possibly the Constitution itself – will be prepared based on the recommendations.

National Minorities

8. *The Constitution of WOSM expressly recognise the right of persons belonging to national minorities to establish and maintain free and peaceful contacts across frontiers with those with whom they share an ethnic, cultural, linguistic or religious identity, or a common cultural heritage.*
 - This recommendation was accepted. An amendment to the WOSM Constitution will be prepared based on the recommendation accepted by the World Scout Committee.

Dissident Associations

9. *No change in WOSM's governance is required in the case of dissident so-called 'Scouts'.*
 - This recommendation was also accepted.

Compliance with the WOSM Constitution

10. *There is no need to change constitutional or governance provisions to deal with failure of NSOs to comply with the WOSM Constitution.*
 - This recommendation was also accepted.

Scout and Guide National Organizations (SAGNOs)

11. *That WOSM develop a comprehensive, updated description of a SAGNO, reflecting our own current policy on membership of WAGGGS and WOSM, including fee payment obligations, and describing all forms/models of membership of the two world organizations.*

- This recommendation was also accepted. A comprehensive, updated description of a Scout and Guide National Organization (commonly referred to as a "SAGNO") will be prepared for use by WOSM, reflecting its own policies and practices on the matter. This will be shared with the Constitutions Committee and the WAGGGS/WOSM Consultative Committee before it is brought to a future World Committee meeting for approval.

Constitutional Amendments

12. *That following the decision of the WSC on these recommendations, the necessary draft amendments to the WOSM Constitution be prepared under the supervision of the Constitutions Committee.*

- This was accepted. The Constitutions Committee will supervise the work identified above that involves amendments to the WOSM Constitution.

2. WSC decisions on GRTF recommendations contained in the GRTF Final Report

In presenting his final report to the WSC in March 2010, GRTF Chairman David Bull highlighted the following points:

- The GRTF members had faced challenges in carrying out their task over great distances with limited opportunities to meet. The responses from NSOs to the GRTF's discussion papers had been very helpful in refining the proposals now being presented.
- A number of issues that the GRTF had dealt with are controversial though many are not; he would concentrate on the former in his introductory remarks.
- Youth involvement in decision-making in the Movement is important; the GRTF understands there is still considerable ongoing debate and not yet any consensus on how to achieve what almost everyone seeks. The GRTF's proposals seek to contribute to making progress in the right direction.
- The method of electing WSC members is also a subject of debate but the GRTF believes its proposal to move to electing one WSC member at a time would be beneficial.
- The partnership between the WSC Chairman and the Secretary General should be clarified, though without changing the title (in English) of 'Chairman' to that of 'President'.
- A formal statement of the entitlements of candidate or potential NSOs should be drawn up.

On the specific subject of Regional Scout Committees and their relationship with the WSC, which was covered by Recommendations 2.3.5 and 2.4.1 of the final report, David Bull noted that the Regions are working well and supported well. However the specific role and functioning of the Regions is of great concern to all. Some would prefer to see WOSM as a "Federation of Regions" while others want to retain a single World Organisation where, for practical reasons, some things are done "regionally". The GRTF supports the latter view, recognises the value of the Regions but believes that governance arrangements need to be adjusted to make the working link between the Regions and the WSC more direct. A clear, strong and understandable argument for the proposed changes must, however, be made if they are to be accepted by the World Scout Conference. The GRTF concluded that the Chairmen of Regional Scout Committees should be given voting rights in the WSC but only as an integral part of the changes in relationship between the regional and world levels.

Commenting on the specific proposals contained in Recommendations 2.3.5 and 2.4.1, David Bull noted that Regional Scout Committees would continue to be elected by Regional Conferences, more or less the same as today; Regional Committee members would serve for the same term as WSC members (whether 3 or 6 years) and coinciding with these terms (i.e. deferred taking office until World Scout Conference); Regional Committees would effectively be sub-committees of the WSC; and NSOs in Regions would continue to meet as often as needed, in Regional Conferences, Summits, Top Leaders meetings, Symposiums, etc.

In the WSC's discussion on this point, the following views were expressed:

- Regional Chairmen are "representatives" of their Region at the WSC. To be coherent, granting the right to vote to Regional Chairmen would imply changing the provision in the WOSM Constitution which states that WSC members do not represent any other body or level (i.e. their NSO or their Region) but are responsible for the interests of the World Organization as a whole. Is this what is wanted?
- Only the World Scout Conference should grant voting rights on the WSC through direct elections. If the Conference feels the WSC is not representative enough, the number of elected members could be increased.
- Granting the right to vote to Regional Chairmen could result in more than one voting member coming from the same NSO. Is this appropriate?
- The question of granting voting rights to Regional Chairmen was debated in Korea and a decision made at that time. It should not be reopened at this stage. NSOs are of course free to raise the matter.

More generally, David Bull noted that, while some proposals from the GRTF would require constitutional amendments or other changes in rules, the most important factor was operating in a transparent way with the aim of supporting NSOs. World Scout Conference Resolution 3/08 had called on the WSC to bring any proposals for constitutional change to NSOs one year in advance of the Conference. This timescale had proved impossible to implement, given the need for consultation with NSOs during the process, but any proposals emanating from the current report should be sent to NSOs as soon as possible.

Finally, he expressed the hope that the WSC and the World Scout Conference in Brazil would bring the work on governance reform to a close. To achieve this would, however, require commitment to argue persuasively for the changes which the WSC decides to put to the Conference for approval.

The WSC then considered the recommendations of the GRTF, as outlined in the report, and decided as follows (numbers refer to the numbering in the GRTF report - the text of the recommendations is shown in italics below, followed by the WSC's decision on each one):

2.1 Youth involvement in Governance

2.1.1 Six Youth Advisers (whose role would be to be consultants to the World Scout Committee and to assist in the shaping of policy) be ex officio, non-voting members of the World Scout Committee.

- Not accepted. The WSC decided to seek alternative ways of ensuring youth membership of the WSC (see below).

2.1.2 Youth Advisers be elected at the World Scout Youth Forum, as at present, but if and when the approach to the Forum changes they should be elected under new arrangements approved by the World Scout Committee.

- Accepted.

2.1.3 The full cost of the involvement of all six Youth Advisers in World Scout Committee meetings (and not just two or three at a time) be a charge on the WOSM budget.

- Accepted, on the basis that the same rules that apply to WSC members will apply to Youth Advisers and that costs relating to WSC meetings only will be funded.

2.1.4 The World Scout Youth Forum continue as at present but that, given the current state of development of youth participation policy, it is inappropriate for the Forum to be an organ of WOSM mentioned in the Constitution.

- Accepted.

2.1.5 The World Scout Committee propose to the next World Scout Conference that the Recommendations of the Forum shall be presented in full to the Conference (without first going to the Committee) for debate and votes.

- Accepted with the deletion of the words "(without first going to the Committee)" and "and votes". It was noted that young delegates who come from the World Scout Youth Forum (WSYF) to the World Scout Conference could persuade their NSOs to put forward the WSYF recommendations as Conference Resolutions.

2.1.6 The maximum age for those involved in youth participation in the governance of WOSM be 30.

- Accepted.

2.2 World Scout Conference

2.2.1 The current allocation of six votes for each delegation be maintained.

- Accepted. It was confirmed that split votes are acceptable.

2.2.2 Ways continue to be sought of allowing the maximum time for the proper conduct of business at World Scout Conferences, including select committees for key agenda topics, Regional meetings, other smaller groupings and so on.

- Accepted.

2.2.3 Resolutions to the Conference be submitted to the Resolutions Committee within the first twenty four hours of the Conference.

- Accepted that earlier submission is desirable but decided that 48 hours is more appropriate.

2.2.4 *Whilst quotas should not be introduced to encourage participation in Conferences by younger delegates, the World Scout Committee should continue to develop appropriate affirmative action, such as lowering fees, so as to continue the present trend of increasing attendance by younger participants.*

- Accepted.

2.2.5 *There should be no change in the current arrangement where each NSO can nominate one candidate for election to the World Scout Committee.*

- Accepted, while noting that this may need to be reconsidered in light of any subsequent decision on a proposal to bring young candidates/members to the WSC.

2.2.6 *Elections to the World Scout Committee be carried out for one vacancy at a time, with the results announced before the next round, until all vacancies are filled.*

- Accepted. It was recognised that this was dependent on having some form of electronic voting (see 2.2.7) and that, under the new constitutional requirements of 3 year terms coming into effect at the next World Scout Conference, there will be 12 WSC members to be elected at each Conference, which means 12 rounds of voting.

2.2.7 *Electronic voting should be used at World Scout Conferences, but only in cases where secrecy is required (for example elections or selection of host NSOs for World Events) or where called for by a majority of delegations or ordered by the Conference Chairman.*

- Accepted, on the basis that electronic voting will be used for elections but will not be used where yes/no/abstain votes are required these will continue to be done using the show of hands/voting card system.

2.2.8 *There should be no change to the existing arrangements whereby only NSOs have voting rights at the World Conference.*

- Accepted.

2.3 Regional Scout Committees

2.3.1 *The system of Regions contributes to the unity of World Scouting and should continue.*

- Accepted.

2.3.2 *The allocation of NSOs to Regions should continue to be the responsibility of the World Scout Committee.*

- Accepted.

2.3.3 *The number of Regions should remain at six but this should be kept under review by the World Scout Committee.*

- Accepted.

2.3.4 *As far as possible, the constitutional arrangements for all Regions should be consistent with each other.*

- Accepted, with the requirement that they also must be in line with the WOSM Constitution.

2.3.5 *The system of Regional Committees described in paragraphs 5.4 to 5.8 (of the GRTF report) should be established.*

- Accepted. (See also 2.4.1 for decision on voting rights for Regional Chairmen.)

2.3.6 *There should be no change proposed by the World Scout Committee to the system of three year terms for World Scout Committee members set up in Korea.*

- Accepted on the basis that the WSC took no view on the desirability or otherwise of a change.

2.3.7 *There should be no change to Article XIX paragraph 2(c) of the Constitution (appointment of Regional Directors).*

- Accepted.

2.4 World Scout Committee

2.4.1 *Chairmen of Regional Committees (see Recommendation 2.3.5) should be voting members of the World Scout Committee.*

- Not accepted. (Note: In response to a question, David Bull noted at this stage that the WSC could still accept the framework explained in the GRTF report, sections 5.4 - 5.8, without according voting rights to Regional Chairmen.)

2.4.2 *That a partnership of the Chairman and the Secretary General is necessary for the success of the World Scout Committee; to this end, the duties of the Chairman, including her/his representational role, should be set out in the Constitution.*

- Accepted.

2.4.3 *That the number of voting members of the World Scout Committee elected at World Conferences should continue to be 12 (plus Chairmen of Regional Committees).*

- Accepted, but without Chairmen of Regional Committees (see 2.4.1. above).

2.4.4 *Induction should be provided for new World Scout Committee members on the lines set out in paragraph 6.7.*

- Accepted.

2.4.5 *There should be a requirement for the World Scout Committee to carry out individual self-evaluations as well as a corporate one, at least once in each Triennium.*

- Accepted.

2.5 Relationships

2.5.1 *The services to and entitlements of potential NSOs should be specified in a formal policy published by the World Scout Committee.*

- Accepted.

2.5.2 *The World Scout Committee should act swiftly where bodies granted consultative status subsequently act so as to detract from the policies or unity of World Scouting.*

- Accepted.

2.5.3 *The Constitution should provide for the World Scout Committee to foster effective relations with the World Scout Foundation.*

- Accepted.

2.6 Communications

2.6.1 *Current arrangements for communications are appropriate, but improvements should be sought, based on regular reviews of progress.*

- Accepted.

2.6.2 *Policies and procedures of WOSM should be collated in a publication or web site, with an index, so that they can be accessed readily.*

- Accepted.

2.6.3 *The World Scout Committee should ensure that NSOs are advised regularly of the principal operational issues that the World Scout Committee is dealing with.*

- Accepted.

2.7 Constitutional Amendments

2.7.1 *The World Scout Committee should record, publish and review periodically all delegations of authority to the Secretary General and others.*

- Not accepted. It was felt this was not required, being at the level of detailed management. (The Chairman of the Constitutions Committee noted that, although this recommendation appeared under the subtitle "Constitutional Amendments", not all of these proposals necessarily need to be in the WOSM Constitution; other solutions may be possible.)

2.7.2 *Article XV of the Constitution should be amended as proposed in paragraph 9.2.*

- The principle of this recommendation was accepted, but the WSC intends this to be covered in Rules of Procedure for the WSC (see 2.7.3 below), not in the WOSM Constitution.

2.7.3 *Standing orders and procedures for the World Scout Committee should be prepared and approved by each World Scout Committee at the beginning of the Triennium.*

- Accepted.

2.7.4 *The responsibility for ensuring that procedural advice is given during Committee meetings/Conferences should be allocated to the Secretary General in the by-laws or the standing orders that replace them.*

- Not accepted. The WSC decided that this should continue to be part of the role of the Chairman of the Constitutions Committee, without excluding advice from the Secretary General, and should be documented.

2.7.5 *There should be appropriate references in the Constitution to WSB Inc (the name of which could be changed if the World Committee feels this is appropriate).*

- Accepted (with no name change). (Note: WSB Inc is the name of the body set up under Swiss law to enable WOSM to conduct its operations within the legal framework of Switzerland.)

2.7.6 *Articles XIII and XVIII of the Constitution be amended as set out in paragraph 9.7.*

- Accepted, noting that precise wording may be changed.

2.7.7 *Following the decision of the World Scout Committee on all the recommendations of the task force, the necessary draft amendments to the Constitution should be prepared in their final draft form, under the supervision of the Constitutions Committee, and communicated to NSOs.*

- Accepted.

3. Youth involvement in governance

Reverting to the subject of youth involvement in governance (see Recommendation 2.1.1 above) and membership of the WSC, the following opinions were expressed by WSC members during the discussion at the meeting. (Note: These views do not necessarily reflect the position of the WSC as a whole.)

- The GRTF proposals do not really respond to the need to strengthen directly the involvement of young people in decision-making. Under the GRTF's proposals, the World Scout Youth Forum (WSYF) will not be part of the decision-making process so it is not valid to have the WSYF elect Youth Advisors as members of the WSC. Ways should rather be sought of having younger people elected to the WSC as voting members by the World Scout Conference. But progress in getting younger candidates nominated has been very slow. The system of Youth Advisors still needs to be kept. But making Youth Advisors members of the WSC – with or without a vote – will not resolve the youth involvement issue at every level of WOSM including in NSOs unless there is a political will at the level of NSOs themselves. The Educational Methods Committee (EMC) is working on a Vision and Strategy for Youth Involvement.
- The increase in the number of WSC members to 21 decided at the last World Scout Conference has helped to get regional "buy in" to decisions; a stronger commitment from the Regions is now evident and they are more involved. Regional Chairmen are being obliged to think on world level, not only regional level. Making Youth Advisors members of the WSC would increase their commitment and value, and the legitimacy of the WSC as leaders of a Youth Organization.
- Concerning the potential size of the WSC if the GRTF's recommendations are accepted, legitimacy is seen as being more important than small numbers. Increasing the size of the WSC would increase the committee's representativity – but this could also be achieved without increasing the numbers. There are ways of managing the work with a large number of "members". NSOs apparently do not favour a smaller WSC; they want more WSC members, with voting rights. But a 'Board of Directors' can not work with 27 members, even if 'only' 12 (i.e. elected members) or even 18 (i.e. 12 elected plus 6 Regional Chairmen) have a vote. One needs to be careful about being perceived as wanting to return to a small WSC when it was only at the last World Scout Conference that Regional Chairmen were made members of the WSC.
- Did the GRTF consider the difference between a representative body and an executive body? Clarity on these two different roles is needed. The GRTF is not proposing any change to the constitutional role of the WSC, which is the executive organ of WOSM. There is no apparent support for delegating more authority to a smaller group, such as the Steering Committee.
- Unless restrictions are placed, there would be a possibility of having 2-3 WSC members from the same NSO, one directly elected by the World Scout Conference, another as a Regional Chairmen, and one as a Youth Advisor. However, WSC members should all serve World Scouting and are not representatives of their own NSO. NSOs will no doubt take that possibility into account when they elect WSC members.

Following the discussion, the WSC decided not to support the GRTF's proposal to make Youth Advisors non-voting members of the WSC but to consider alternative approaches to increasing the level of youth involvement in decision-making.

Later in the meeting, the WSC considered a new draft proposal which had been drawn up as an alternative to the GRTF's recommendations. This stated:

The WSC recognises and welcomes its obligations under World Scout Conference Resolution 14/08, Youth Involvement in Decision Making, to develop a youth involvement Vision and Strategy. As part of this, it has considered the recommendation from the GRTF for the six Youth Advisors to be non-voting members of the WSC, which it could not support. However it did not wish to reach this conclusion without making an alternative recommendation to strengthen youth involvement in the work of the WSC itself.

Accordingly the WSC wishes to give notice that it will propose to the World Scout Conference in Brazil the following resolution:

Youth Advisors and the World Scout Committee

To add to Article XII 2(a), Voting Members, of the Constitution of the World Organization of the Scout Movement:

- *Two Youth Advisors under 30 years of age elected by the World Scout Conference from among the six Youth Advisors already elected by the World Scout Youth Forum.*

The two elected Youth Advisors will be added to the constitutional provision for 12 elected voting members of the WSC, making 14 in total.

The provision that in no case shall more than one elected member from any one NSO serve on the WSC in any one period would be retained.

In the discussion on this draft proposal, the following views were expressed:

- This is an interesting and innovative idea. Working with two young people elected by the World Scout Conference, with full rights, rather than 6 Youth Advisors would add a different dimension. But would prefer candidatures to be open to any young person nominated by their NSO.
- NSOs should in any case still be encouraged to nominate candidates for election to the WSC who are under 30.
- What would be the role of the 4 Youth Advisors who are not elected to the WSC? Would they continue to attend WSC meetings or simply be members of the Planning Committee of the next WSYF? This will need to be clarified. There are arguments in favour of the remaining 4 Youth Advisors still being invited to attend the WSC meetings and being part of its work and its subcommittees. They make an important contribution.
- There are many implications to be considered. For example, the WSYF is not mentioned in the Constitution and is not therefore a "legitimate" body to elect members to the WSC. What would be the deadline for nominations? Only NSOs can nominate candidates for election to the WSC; how would these Youth Advisor candidates be nominated?
- There is a risk that if an NSO had a candidate over 30 whom they wanted to be elected to the WSC, they would not send a good potential candidate to the WSYF, for fear that person would be elected as a Youth Advisor and end up splitting the vote in the WSC elections at the World Scout Conference.
- It would be better to go for a direct quota of WSC members under the age of 30 to be directly elected by the World Scout Conference. But that approach would lose the link with the WSYF, which offers a good experience of youth involvement in decision making.
- Quotas are not ideal but may be necessary. Don't underestimate the NSOs' ability to make the wise decisions about whom to elect. But the last World Scout Conference rejected a proposal for a quota system; will the Conference accept this time?

A consensus emerged that having two people under the age of 30 as voting members of the WSC was a good proposal to develop further. A full proposal will be brought to the next meeting of the WSC.

The Constitutions Committee is now working on the text of specific proposals to take to the World Scout Conference, including changes to the WOSM Constitution where these are required.

Yours sincerely,

Luc Panissod
Secretary General WOSM